

The Challenge of International Intervention: Balancing Justice and Order

Dr. Maxine David

Course description

The fundamental organising principle in the international system has long been one of state sovereignty and therefore non-intervention. Seen as fundamental to maintaining order in an anarchic international system, states are considered to have authority over a defined and internationally recognised territory, protected from external intervening forces. In 1991, George Bush Senior spoke of a 'New World Order', one in which the United Nations would now be free to fulfil its founders' visions. Human rights protection therefore rose to the top of the political agenda.

Since then, the principle of non-intervention has been challenged by successive interventions into the sovereign affairs of states by international organisations, notably the United Nations and NATO, as well as other states. As if in acceptance of this new world order in which human rights protection could – would – be privileged over traditional understandings of sovereignty, in 2005 the international "community" adopted the principle of the Responsibility to Protect (R2P). R2P has since been widely debated by reason of the obligations it places on states to protect the wellbeing of their citizens and the vulnerability of states to outside interventions when they fail to protect those citizens. In what might be seen as an extended period of probation, the commitment of states and other international actors to protect human rights (justice), even at the expense of sovereign principles (order), has been put to the test – as has the New World Order.

In this course, students will be introduced to the underpinning concepts and competing understandings of intervention in situations of conflict, state collapse, humanitarian and human rights emergencies. Students will learn to identify and deliver a critical analysis of those factors that shape international intervention. Emphasis is then placed on the application of concepts and theories to real-life scenarios, examining a few of the case studies that have been particularly significant in respect of developing international-level responses to crises. Ultimately, students will be required to deliver well-evidenced verdicts on whether the 'international community' privilege order over justice or justice over order.

Course themes

Throughout the course, students will be asked to consider when and how real moments of change occur and to evaluate the extent to which we see more continuity than change in the international system. Four core themes in the study of Intervention will sit at the heart of our studies: Sovereignty, Legitimacy,



CENTER FOR COMPARATIVE CONFLICT STUDIES

Legality, Human Rights. The aim of the course is to help students understand the arguments for and against intervention: what motivates actors to intervene, what constrains them, the inherent costs and dangers of their choices. Through study of a number of interventions, students will debate the choices available to actors in order to achieve an understanding of the context in which difficult decisions are made and the consequences of those decisions.

Introductory/ Background reading

Essential Reading

- Armstrong, David (1999) 'Law, Justice and the idea of a world society.' *International Affairs*. 75 (3): 547-561.
- **Read all 3 essays:**
Bull, Hedley (Various). Chapter 8. Hedley in his Own Words. *Three Essays*. Available online http://press.anu.edu.au/sdsc/hedley/mobile_devices/ch08.html [accessed 06 April 2015].
- **Entire issue of:**
Snippe, Marjolijn, Mehta, Vijay and Melber, Henning (eds.) (2011) 'Erskine Barton Childers – For a democratic United Nations and the Rule of Law'. *Development Dialogue*, 56 (June) Available online http://www.unitingforpeace.com/books/Development_Dialogue.pdf [accessed 06 April 2015].

Highly recommended

- Bellamy, A. (2002) 'What's so wrong with human rights?' *International Journal of Human Rights*, 6, 4: 121-133
- Chandler, D. (2003) 'Expanding the Research Agenda of Human Rights: Reply to Bellamy' *International Journal of Human Rights*, 7, 1: 128-140.

Earn Academic Credit for your participation in this course:

In order to receive academic credit for your participation in the summer school, you must submit a learning log by no later than Noon on Monday, July 13th to your course professor. Click here for Learning Log Instructions.

Day 1

Understanding International Intervention

Morning Session: Introduction and Course Outline: Building an Understanding of Purpose

The Reality of War – Bosnian Conflict

Recommended Reading:

- Ayoob, Mohammed (2002) 'Humanitarian Intervention and State Sovereignty' *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 6,1: 81-102
- Coady, C. (2002) 'The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention', United States Institute for Peace: 'Peaceworks No 45'. Available online <http://www.usip.org/publications/the-ethics-armed-humanitarian-intervention> [accessed 6 April 2015].
- Fridman, Orli (2015) 'How Belgraders Remember the NATO Bombings'. *BalkanInsight*. 30 March 2015. Available online at <http://www.balkaninsight.com/en/article/how-belgraders-remember-the-nato-bombings> [accessed 6 April 2015].

Additional Reading:

- De Waal, Alex., and Omaar, Rakiya (1994) 'Can Military Intervention be "Humanitarian"?' *Middle East Report*, 187/188 (March-June): 2-8
- Evans, Gareth, (2008) 'The Responsibility to Protect: An Idea Whose Time Has Come...and Gone?' *International Relations*, 22, 3: 283-298
- Welsh, Jennifer, (2009) Implementing the 'Responsibility to Protect', Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law, and Armed Conflict Policy Brief 1/2009. Available online http://www.elac.ox.ac.uk/downloads/r2p_policybrief_180209.pdf [accessed 06 April 2015].

Day 2

Northern Iraq 1999-2001 & Theorising International Relations

Morning Session: Sovereign Rights vs International Morals: The New World Order

Afternoon Session: Theorising International Intervention

Recommended Reading:

- Hurd, Ian (1999) 'Legitimacy and Authority in International Politics', *International Organization*, 53, 2: 379-408.
- Jahn, Beate (2012) 'Humanitarian Intervention - What's In a Name'. *International Politics*, 49 (1): 36-58.
- Mayall, James (1991) 'Non-Intervention, Self-Determination and the "New World Order"', *International Affairs*, 67, 3: 421-429

- Orford, Anne (2009) 'What Can We Do To Stop People Harming Others?' in Edkins, J & Zehfuss, M (Eds) Global Politics. A New Introduction, London: Routledge, 427-53.

Additional Reading:

- Adelman, Howard (1992) 'Humanitarian Intervention: The Case of the Kurds' International Journal of Refugee Law, 4, 1: 4-38
- Snyder, J. (2008) 'Realism, Refugees, and Strategies of Humanitarianism' Presentation at University of Oxford, Centre for International Studies and the Refugee Studies Centre, October 17 2008.
- White, Nigel D. (1999) 'The Legality of the Threat of Force against Iraq', Security Dialogue, 30, 1: 75-86

Day 3

Failings and Consequences: Yugoslavia in the 1990s

Morning Session: Crimes against Humanity

The Weight of Chains: <https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PL1EC1C70D59D0EE7D>

Srebrenica – A Cry from the Grave: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Fliw801iX84>

Robert Fisk – Bosnian war documentary 1993 part 1, part 2, part 3:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tsv1XlmcTGo>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xmFsyoMC9tw>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KP7kt8HEK5U>

***We will not have time to watch all these in class – students are strongly encouraged to watch them in their own time.**

Afternoon Session: The Kosovo Crisis 1998-1999: Overruling Sovereignty

1999 – A Documentary about Kosovo War and Ethnic Cleansing:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ulPsNrMMZ3E>

2008 Debate – UN Ambassador Nominee Samantha Power vs. Jeremy Scahill:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QqpQvIT---c>

Recommended Reading:

- Chinkin, Christine M. (1999) 'Kosovo: A 'Good' or 'Bad' War' *American Journal of International Law*, 3, 4: 841-847
- Kerr, Rachel (2005) 'The Road from Dayton to Brussels? The International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia and the Politics of War Crimes in Bosnia', *European Security*, 14:3, 319-337.
- Parish, Matthew (2007) 'The Demise of the Dayton Protectorate', *Journal of Intervention and Statebuilding*, Volume 1, Special Supplement: 11-23
- Solana, Javier (1999) 'NATO's Success in Kosovo', *Foreign Affairs*, 78, 6: 114-120.

Additional Reading:

- Freedman, Lawrence (2000) 'Victims and Victors: Reflections on the Kosovo War', *Review of International Studies*, 26: 335-58.

Day 4

The Responsibility to Protect

Morning Session: Darfur 2005-9: A Retreat from Humanitarianism?

Afternoon Session: Burma & Cyclone Nargis 2008: The Limits of International Responsibility

Recommended Reading:

- Albright, Madeleine (2008) 'The End of Intervention', *The Washington Post/New York Times* Available online http://www.nytimes.com/2008/06/11/opinion/11iht-edalbright.1.13635780.html?_r=0 [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Arbour, Louise, 'The Responsibility to Protect as a Duty of Care in International Law and Practice,' *Review of International Studies* 34, no. 3 (July 2008), pp. 445–58.
- De Waal, Alex (2007) 'Darfur and the Failure of the Responsibility to Protect', *International Affairs*, 83, 6: 1039-1054.
- Ford, Stuart (2009) 'Is the Failure to Respond Appropriately to a Natural Disaster a Crime Against Humanity? The Responsibility to Protect and Individual Criminal Responsibility in the Aftermath of Cyclone Nargis'. Available online http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1437785 [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Walker, Peter (1998) 'Victims of natural disaster and the right to humanitarian assistance: a practitioner's view'. Available online <https://www.icrc.org/eng/resources/documents/misc/57jpje.htm> [accessed 08 April 2015].

Additional Reading:

- Barber, Rebecca (2009) 'The Responsibility to Protect the Survivors of Natural Disaster: Cyclone Nargis, a Case Study', *Journal of Conflict and Security Law* 14 (3)
- Cohen, Roberta (2009) 'The Burma Cyclone and the Responsibility to Protect', *Global Responsibility to Protect* 1 pp. 253-257
- Luck, Edward (2010) 'The Responsibility to Protect: Growing Pains or Early Promise?' *Ethics & International Affairs*, Volume 24.4. Available online http://www.carnegiecouncil.org/publications/journal/24_4/response/001.html [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Massingham, Eve (2009) 'Military intervention for humanitarian purposes: does the Responsibility to Protect doctrine advance the legality of the use of force for humanitarian ends?' *International Review of the Red Cross* Volume 91, Number 876. Available online <https://www.icrc.org/eng/resources/documents/article/review/review-876-p803.htm> [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Rosenberg, Sheri P, (2009) 'Responsibility to Protect: a Framework for Prevention' *Global Responsibility to Protect* v1, 442-477
- Williams, P. and Bellamy, A. (2005) 'The Responsibility to Protect and the Crisis in Darfur', *Security Dialogue*, 36, 1: 27-47.

Day 5

Justice in Libya, Order in Syria?

Morning Session: Libya: a "Successful" Intervention?

Afternoon Session: Syria: a Discourse of Non-Intervention

Recommended Reading:

- Daalder, Ivo H. and Stavridis, James G (2012) 'NATO's Victory in Libya. The Right Way to Run an Intervention'. *Foreign Affairs*. Available online <http://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/137073/ivo-h-daalder-and-james-g-stavridis/natos-victory-in-libya> [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Kuperman, Alan J (2013) *Lessons from Libya: How Not to Intervene?* Policy Brief, Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs, Harvard Kennedy School, September 2013. Available online http://belfercenter.ksg.harvard.edu/publication/23387/lessons_from_libya.html [accessed 08 April 2015].

- Pearlman, Wendy (2014) 'The Argument against U.S. Intervention in Syria ... And Why It's Wrong'. Huffington Post. Available online http://www.huffingtonpost.com/wendy-pearlman/us-syria-intervention_b_4823932.html [accessed 08 April 2015].
- See United Nations News Centre for News Focus on Syria. Available online <http://www.un.org/apps/news/infocusRel.asp?infocusID=146&Body=Syria&Body1=> [accessed 08 April 2015].
- United Nations (n.d.) Charter of the United Nations. Available online <http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/index.shtml/> [accessed 08 April 2015].

Additional Reading:

- BBC News Middle East (2014) 'Syria: The Story of the Conflict'. BBC News. Available online <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-26116868> [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Ensor, Josie and Laing, Aislinn (2011). 'Battle for Libya: timeline.' The Telegraph. Available online <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/africaandindianocean/libya/10368643/Battle-for-Libya-timeline.html> [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Heisbourg, François 'Russia's Success, the West's failure' The New York Times, 7 June 2013. Available online <http://www.nytimes.com/2013/06/08/opinion/global/russias-success-the-wests-failure.html> [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Powell, Catherine (2012) 'Libya. A Multilateral Constitutional Moment?' Georgetown University Law Center. Available online <http://scholarship.law.georgetown.edu/facpub/983/> [accessed 08 April 2015].
- Watt, Nicholas (2014) Syria crisis. failure to intervene will have terrible consequences, says Blair. The Guardian. Available online <http://www.theguardian.com/politics/2014/apr/07/syria-failure-intervene-terrible-consequences-blair> [accessed 08 April 2015].

Day 6

Course Conclusions

Morning Session: The Ukraine Crisis and How It Helps Us Reach Conclusions.

Recommended Reading:

- Bull, Hedley (Various). Chapter 8. Hedley in his Own Words. Three Essays. [accessed 06 April 2015].
- Emerson, Michael (2014) 'The EU-Ukraine-Russia Sanctions Triangle'. *CEPS Commentary*. 13 October 2014.



CENTER FOR COMPARATIVE CONFLICT STUDIES

[http://aei.pitt.edu/55871/1/CEPS_Commentary_Sanctions_Triangle%2C_M_Emerson_\(2\).pdf](http://aei.pitt.edu/55871/1/CEPS_Commentary_Sanctions_Triangle%2C_M_Emerson_(2).pdf)

[accessed 06 April 2015].

- Freedman, Lawrence (2014) 'Ukraine and the Art of Crisis Management'. *Survival*, 56, 3: 7-42.
- MacFarlane, Neil & Menon, Anand (2014) 'The EU and Ukraine'. *Survival*, 56, 3: 95-101.
- Mankoff, Jeffrey (2014) 'How Russia Won Crimea and Lost Ukraine'. *Foreign Affairs* 93: 60-68.

I have tweeted fairly regularly on Ukraine - follow me to get access to my entire feed on Ukraine.

See also my blogs for The Conversation: <https://theconversation.com/profiles/maxine-david-100989>